



Cinematic Adaptation: A Comparative Study of Bollywood movie *Noor* and Saba Imtiaz's Novel *Karachi You're Killing Me*

Nargis Saleem¹

ABSTRACT:

The present study is aimed at investigating Bollywood movie *Noor* as an adaptation of Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me*. Linda Hutcheon in her book *The Theory of Adaptation* (2006), gives theory of adaption which provides relationship between literature and film. Adaptation theory is based on the idea that there is an unequal but strong bond between literary works and visual arts such as theatrical production, a documentary or a movie. A filmmaker has to make certain adaptations in order to make his visual work presentable to the audience. The aforementioned movie, *Noor*, takes story from Saba Imtiaz's novel and moulds its characters, scenes, places, situations and the setting in order to cater the cinematic demands. The protagonists as well as subject matter of both these works are similar, facing the same journalistic issues under similar social, political and professional challenges. Such similarity makes this movie an adapted work of the given novel. The movie adapts certain episodes and situations from the novel and gives them Bollywood colour and shape. The adaptation it is aptly investigated through the lens of cinematic adaptation. This study enlightens the readers to realize the positive and natural impact of imitation between written and visual arts when they are converted to each other.

Key Words: *Adaptation, Noor, Karachi You're Killing Me, Comparative Analysis*

¹ Riphah International University (nargis.saleem@riphah.edu.pk)





1. INTRODUCTION

The present research is an attempt to analyze Bollywood movie *Noor* as an adapted work of Saba Imtiaz's novel, *Karachi You're Killing Me* from the perspective of adaptation which was theorized by Linda Hutcheon in her work titled as *The Theory of Adaptation* (2006). As described by Linda Hutcheon, adaptation means conversion or transformation of text into another genre, or medium like a stage play, a film or even an animation. In the aforementioned work, Hutcheon defines and explains the features of adaption which attempts to explore an important correlation between a literary work and a movie. The process of adapting a written work of literature i.e. a novel, a play, or a short story with the help of cinematography and sound design to bring the story to life on screen is known as cinematic adaptation of literature. The adjustment of writings to film or TV can be intricate as movie producers should choose what components of the source material to incorporate, what to forget about, and how to change the composed word into a visual configuration.

A close look at both works under present study proves the fact that the current movie, *Noor*, is an adaptation of Saba Imtiaz's novel, *Karachi You're killing Me*. It is because there is close resemblance between the two works: the first one is an imitated version of the latter. Though the novel under present discussion is set in Karachi with difference in terms of its title, characters' names, places, scenes and setting, yet the movie under current research is a filmed version of the former. The novel's story undergoes some transformation after it is adapted in Bollywood movie, *Noor*. This movie is basically a staged or filmed version of the given novel. Both works are journalistic in nature and movie takes plot from the novel, yet as per theory of adaptation, novel's story has been adapted in order to suit to the purpose and requirements of the movie.

Saba Imtiaz's novel revolves around personal as well journalistic life of Ayesha Khan, aspiring to become a leading journalist amidst unfavorable political, social, economic and professional life. She has many friends i.e. Saad, Hassan and Zara with whom she can share her aspirations and frustrations. Her boss, Kamran, is unsupportive, depriving her of salary and work opportunities. Her interview of an Al-Qaida detainee is theft by Bannerji who shares hotel bedroom with her as her supposed lover. It makes her conspicuous in the eyes of establishment, forcing her to flee Pakistan amidst life threats. Cheating causes Bannerji's removal from his service. The novel ends on reunion of Saad and Ayesha as lovers.

Similar situations prevail in Sonakshi Sinha's movie *Noor*, in which Indian journalist Noor plays lead role as a frustrated lover and a journalist. Noor Chaudhry has very few friends: the source of her catharsis. Like Kamran, Noor's boss, Shekhar, is also unsupportive, forcing her to resign. Noor, too, obtains a story exposing kidney scam about Dr. Shinday. Life threat forces her to leave India. She returns after her interviewee, Vilas, is murdered by Dr. Shinday. Before she meets her lover, Saad, she is able to punish Dr. Shinday through her social media forum.

The abovementioned similarities are evidence to prove that the movie is an adaptation of Saba Imtiaz's novel under present research. Though names and places are transformed, yet the



protagonists of both these works are surrounded by similar circumstances right from start to the end. Apart from that, the given movie moulds the novel's plot to suit the requirements of the movie. Songs, background music, Malti, her brother, Vilas' death and Dr. Shinday's arrest and imprisonment are adaptations to fit the novel in movie's format. Under the cover of adaptation, the filmmaker has either ignored some episodes of the given novel or he has moulded it. Although, the movie is not an exact replica of the novel, yet, as a whole, it is an adapted version of the original novel.

After making a comparative study of this novel and the film, it is clear that the film does not escape adaptation. The novel's content, setting, events, characters, their names and related issues are not the same as film shows. It is because the novel and the movies are two distinct genres with distinctive requirements. Furthermore, movie producers have to consider the assumptions of the crowd, the requirements of the medium, and the specialized and imaginative parts of filmmaking. Therefore, the novel and the movie are partially similar and the vice versa. By comparing Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me* with the present movie *Noor*, the current study explores that the said movie is an imitated version of the chosen work of literature. The theoretical framework of adaptation is used to examine the intertextuality of both literary works.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

In order to develop background information and research gap to the Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me* along with Bollywood movie *Noor* and the theory of adaption, various research sources such as research articles, dissertations, research journals and reviews have been explored. The main objective of the literature review is to see previous knowledge with relevance to the theory and the works under present investigation so that research gap may be developed. Such foreknowledge builds up foundation of the study to see the present research in the light of the past endeavors.

Khamsa Qasim (2022) in an article titled as *It's Karachi, its, Where Life and Love Come to Die": Representing Gender, Space and Identity in Karachi You Are killing Me*, explores the impact of urban theory upon gender roles in Karachi where women such as Ayesha Khan has to face with issues pertaining to traditional gender roles. Consequently, woman is a spectator in patriarchal system of urban Karachi. The researcher investigates gender discrimination, inequality and social and political violence in Karachi. Karachi has been presented through the female gaze of Ayesha Khan, the protagonist in Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me*. The novel presents multiple themes about life. It represents Karachi as a living organism that produces pro-life forces. It explores a sinister being that represses gender, creating a vast gulf between individuals and communities.

Samar Zaki & Nighat (2022) in their research paper titled as *Glocalism, Disguised Oppression and Parochialism: A Study of Karachi You're Killing Me*, present the dilapidating conditions of locals in postcolonial world as depicted by a Pakistani novelist, Saba Imtiaz. The given research explores the subaltern condition of the locals who have to undergo unfavourable circumstances in capitalist regime. It highlights the illusion of the locals who assume to empower



their fellow beings, but in reality, status quo prevails everywhere. Therefore, the locals have been viewed as parochial and are placed in reductive category. The colonial narrative eclipses the weak narrative of the locals, keeping them marginalized. By depicting the negative picture of the postcolonial world, the novelist plays a role of native informer and endorses the colonialists, narrative. The local female's narrative seems weak as she is restricted to pinpoint certain names and institutions in the given novel. As a whole, this novel highlights the real life issues faced by the locals in Karachi.

Dinesh Prakash (2017) in a review, of the film *Noor*, titled as *Fails to shine for a moment*, does not see shining side of movie. Instead, she finds it a boring and amateurish attempt to adapt a novel. Except Sonaksi Sinha's expressions, nothing is worth appreciating. The dialogues, love scenes, the songs, character of Saad and monologues are not refined enough to create any interest. According to the reviewer, kidney scam type stories suit the purpose of a novel, not a movie.

Jetkot (2017), in a review titled as *Simple and feel Good*, is all in praise for the movie. The review is impressed by the way the protagonist talks to herself. It is because monologues are part of the reviewer's habits. This review gives full credit to the heroine whose performance has been superb throughout the movie. Source material is also good. Other characters have also done well to suit the purpose of the given movie.

In a review, dated May 10, 2014, Sankalpita Singh explores some characteristics of Saba Imtiaz's novel, *Karachi You're Killing me*. According to the reviewer, the book contains entertainment as well as a plot which makes it a good book to read. Karachi born novelist's, Saba Imtiaz, novel revolves around adventures and misadventures of Ayesha Khan. She is at the mercy of her boss whose illogical and ridiculous media policy forces Ayesha Khan to remain stuck to reporting of unimportant stories such as bakery opening and fashions weeks, depriving her of sky high aspirations. Her friends such as Zara, Hassan and Saad give her a bit of solace and consolation. According to the reviewer, Ayesha's adventure of Larkana, her witty remarks about life and her struggle make this book worth-reading. In the end, the reviewer hopes to read more such works from the pen of Saba Imtiaz. She advises the reader to read this novel. They might enjoy in the same way as the reviewer did.

Nudrat kamal (2014), in a review on Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me*, feels excited to see the widening scope of Pakistani fictions about serious as well as light issues. Besides praising a crime thriller, the reviewer expresses her goodwill for the Saba's current novel. The novel is about life of a 20 years old girl, Ayesha Khan, whose career as a journalist is full of absurd reporting she carries out on daily basis in Karachi. She has to cover silly and irritating stories. Besides, her laziness and drinking nature portrays another side of modern culture prevailing in Urban Karachi. Novel's humour and light tone make this novel worth-reading. The novel focuses real life issues faced by the people in and around Karachi. The novel is episodic in the beginning. Apart from certain flaws, this novel provides an opportunity for the readers to laugh at the absurdity and flaws of Karachi based people.

Somak Gushal in a review (2014) explores some features of the novel. According to the reviewer, Saba Imtiaz's novel follows the tradition of Henry Fielding's picaresque novel which is episodic in nature. The novel shows life of a journalist who has to cover minor and major incidents.



Though she gets meager salary, yet her hard work is given appreciation from her boss. She is a symbol of fashionable modern women who prefer to partying and taking alcohol. Her life is always at risk. Once she barely escapes death in a bomb blast. Ayesha's life is dull except she meets her 'Darcy'. The turn in the events takes place after half of the novel. The love reunion between Ayesha and Saad is a fine ending which may lead to a sequel.

The review of literature indicates that much work has been done on the works under present study. However, both these works have not been investigated from the perspective of cinematic adaptation. It shows that there is research gap which needs to be fulfilled. Therefore, the present research fulfills the research gap by analyzing these works through the lens of cinematic adaptation.

3. RESEARCH STATEMENT

Even a cursory glance at Bollywood movie *Noor* is enough to indicate a strong impression that this movie can be investigated through the lens of Linda Hutcheon's theory of adaption by making its comparative analysis with Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me*.

4. RESEARCH QUESTIONS

- How does Bollywood movie *Noor* depict cinematic adaptation of Saba Imtiaz's *Karachi You're Killing Me*?
- How does the cinematic adaptation affect characters' thoughts and feelings in the movie, *Noor*?
- How far does the cinematic adaptation replicate *Karachi You're Killing Me* in the given movie, *Noor*?

5. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The present research takes theory of adaptation from Linda Hutcheon's work *The Theory of Adaptation* (2006). As the theoretical framework, adaptation theory examines the process of changing one form of art into another, such as turning a play, a novel or other fictional writing into a movie or a musical display. The idea uses a variety of academic fields such as literary studies, film studies, and cultural studies in order to explain how adaptations function and what they might reveal about the interrelationships across various artistic mediums. The main focus of adaptation theory is on how the aesthetics and other particulars of the original source material are altered during the adaptation process. The theory takes into account how adaptations can either stay true to the original material or take artistic license to adapt the narrative to the new media or audience.

The cultural and historical circumstances in which adaptations are made and received are also explored by adaptation theory. It takes into account how alterations in technology, audience expectations, and cultural values may affect the process of adaptation and the result thereof. Methodologically, adaptation theory promotes multidisciplinary analysis that incorporates a variety of methodologies and viewpoints. Close reading, comparative analysis, or reception studies are methods that academics who study adaptation theory may employ to investigate the connections between the source text and its adaptation. Ultimately, adaptation theory offers a



comprehensive and adaptable framework for examining the intricate and dynamic relationship between various art forms as well as the larger cultural, social, and historical settings in which they are created and appreciated.

6. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The present research is an attempt to investigate director Sunil Sippy's movie *Noor* as an adaptation of Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me*. It is a qualitative research in which thematic analysis is made to explore presence of adaptation. It is aimed at exploring cinematic adaptation in the movie under current research, making a comparative study of both these works. In order to support the data, extracts from the primary sources have been quoted. The under discussion movie *Noor* and Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me* are primary sources of the current research process; whereas research articles, reviews, dissertations and other sources have been selected as secondary sources of the research.

7. DATA ANALYSIS

This data analysis is aimed at analyzing Bollywood film *Noor* as an adaptation of Saba Imtiaz's novel, *Karachi You're Killing Me*. It is a comparative study which is an attempt to investigate how adaptation comes into place in characters, events, setting and storyline of Saba Imtiaz's novel in the movie *Noor*. This work attempts to explore adaptation in thoughts, feelings and psyche of the characters. Furthermore, it explores to what an extent *Noor* is a replica of the original literary work i.e. *Karachi You're Killing Me*. The entire data is a comprehensive answer to the three research questions.

The close look at both these works shows that there is presence of cinematic adaptation in the movie under current investigation, for this movie is an attempt to visualize Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me*. The titles, the protagonists' names, the incidents as well as settings are quite different in both works. Even a bird's eye view of titles of both these works indicates strong impression that they are not alike in any respect. *Karachi You're Killing Me* and *Noor* are two unlike titles because the novel's title manifests impact of Karachi upon the protagonist, Ayesha, and other characters; whereas, the movie's title revolves around life of the protagonist, Noor, who is depicted in Indian Mumbai. The movie is set in Mumbai, a famous Indian city. The first sign of adaptation can be observed in the cities where the novel and the film take place.

The movie is replete with names, circumstances, and events which are adaptations of Saba Imtiaz's novel. The two works under this study are set in two different countries, Pakistan and India. The very title of the novel is enough to describe it as story of Pakistan and Pakistanis; whereas Sunil Sippy's Bollywood movie, *Noor*, is Indian story from every perspective. Keeping in view the timeline, the novel is political in nature as it depicts the deteriorating social, political and economic condition of Karachi, Larkana and adjoining areas during PPP era under President Asif Ali Zardari. On the other hand, the given movie is apolitical in nature; rather, it depicts journalistic ideals, hurdles and role of capitalists in Indian Mumbai.



Apart from that, characters' names in both these works are quite different from each other. Certain characters such as Nadia Baig, the spokesman to Chief Minister, Riffat, Saad's auntie, Kamran's wife, Sana, Shah Rukh, the crime reporter, Sania, the chief political correspondent, Akbar, Farah (the model), Samya and many others are either adopted or missing in the movie, *Noor*. Shekhar replaces Karam; Noor replaces Ayesha Khan; photographer Ali and his girl friend, Sandra, the spokesman for US embassy in Pakistan, Sameer and Jemmy are adaptations from Saba's novel. After taking main concept from the novel, the filmmaker has adapted the names and places in order to give it Bollywood shape and colour.

Besides, the names of places and events from the novel are also shaped as per the traditional Bollywood movies. Most of real life places such as Abdullah Shah Ghazi's shrine, Karachi literary festival, culture festival in Karachi, Larkana, Islamabad and seashores of Indian Ocean near Karachi have been sacrificed in order to shape *Noor* in Bollywood setting. Saba Imtiaz's novel presents comprehensive picture of literary festival as well as cultural festival in Karachi where Pakistani culture, Afghan Taliban, Syrian issues, Karachi politics and role of Pakistani establishment are hot topics of discussion among the visitors. The entire fashion show gives it Pakistani colour where dress designers, shoes, dresses and locals' issues are debated among the participants. Contrarily, the current movie does not find any space for such activities as Pakistan related issues have been ignored in order to adapt it according to Indian cinema.

The story of Sameer khan whose father had been illegally detained in Guantanamo for years, is strange to the Bollywood movie, *Noor*. Several chapters in Saba's novel have been dedicated to the entire episode of the detainee in Guantanamo. Saba has sketched comprehensive picture of his abduction, imprisonment, torture and subsequent release. Sameer's invitation to Ayesha for interview, her journey and subsequent interview grip the readers' attention. The movie adapts this story and invents a new one about a kidney scam in which Dr. Shinday, a close ally of Shekhar, is involved. This scandalous story of the movie is an adaptation from novel's stories such as polio vaccine scam and the detainee's interview.

The filmmaker in the current movie attempts to give life to the scam in which housemaid Malti's brother, Villas, suffers. Initially, Villas is trapped by Dr. Shinday, giving him false promise of job. Consequent upon some stomach pain, he robs Villas of a kidney and leaves him to lie on his bed. Malti takes Noor Chaudhry to Villas' bedroom where she films an interview to be aired on her channel. It creates thrill in the movie as Shekhar cannot resist the pressure from Dr. Shinday who is a business ally of his wife's family. This documentary takes Villas' life and worsens life of his sister, Malti. Malti and his brother's story is an adaptation of Saba's present novel which describes detailed interview of a Guantanamo detainee. Hence, the story of an Al-Qaida detainee has been transformed into kidney scam in order to give Bollywood colour to the movie. Dr. Shinday's scandalous story sacrifices original story depicted in the novel.

Saba Imtiaz's novel depicts bleak Pakistani establishment whose cops keep on spying, harassing and blackmailing the common people, detainees and journalists. The Al-Qaida detainee's family along with Ayesha Khan is spied 24/7. Ayesha's story of the given detainee is



plagiarized to be published in CNN. On the contrary, being a Bollywood movie, *Noor* does not focus on Pakistani establishment; whereas it also depicts professional jealousy among journalists who attempt to steal others' stories for their vested interests. Hence, interview with Al-Qaida detainee is adapted to kidney scam which sends Dr. Shinday behind the bar. Ayesha Khan flees Pakistan to England in order to escape cops of Pakistani intelligence agency; whereas Noor leaves India for Dubai to save her life from Dr. Shinday.

Being journalists, Ayesha Khan and Noor are faced with almost similar circumstances but with slight variation and adaptation. Ayesha Khan is deceived by a foreign journalist, James Maxwell, whom she loves and shares her bed in a hotel. Jimmy deceives Ayesha and publishes her interview by his own name in CNN. It hurts Ayesha Khan whose dreams of being a successful journalist are shattered by the one whom she has loved wholeheartedly. An adapted story takes place in the movie in which Noor Chaudhry is deceived by Ionica Bannerji who shares bed with Noor Chaudhary. Similarly, he obtains information about interview and publishes it by his own name. The movie adapts the original story of the novel and invents a new one to suit the requirements of cinematic audience. Difference in stories of Al-Qaida detainee and Dr. Shinday's kidney scam manifests adaptation of the original source taken from Saba Imtiaz's novel.

The character of Malti, the housemaid, is another such example of adaptation because such character is not present in the novel, a primary source of this film. Her character occupies pivotal role as she is a humble, loving and loyal servant who is the only one helping and caring for Noor Chaudhry. Subsequent events show how her interview helps Noor Chaudhry in her career as a journalist. It is Malti whose entrance adds some thrill in the movie, changing it from comic to the tragic one. Furthermore, the kidney scam and subsequent murder of Malti's brother are the director's innovations, having nothing to do with Saba Imtiaz's novel.

Noor Chaudhry's interview of Sunny Leone is another example which shows that the director has made deliberate attempt to give it Bollywood colour as she represents India. The film star, Sunny Leone, is more a digression than an episode in the movie. No such story takes place in the novel. It is mere adaptation which is aimed at presenting cinematic interest among the audience.

Both novel and the movie depict love affair between girl protagonists and their lovers with adapted names and situations. *Karachi You're Killing Me* depicts love affair between Ayesha Khan and Saad; whereas the film *Noor* shows Noor and Saad loving each other. There is much difference in stories related to the characters in the above mentioned works. In the novel, Ayesha Khan meets Saad's family on Saad's birthday night where she observes cold response from Saad's mother and other members including Saad himself. Ayesha has to answer multiple questions about her future prospects in her profession. But movie adapts this scene. Here, Noor meets Saad's mother in her house where no birthday party takes place. On the contrary to Ayesha Khan's departure from Saad's house in the novel, Shekhar calls Noor and provides her an excuse to leave Saad's house.

A comparison between Saba Imtiaz's *Karachi You're Killing Me* and Sunil Sippy's *Noor* shows the impact of adaptation on internal world of the characters. This movie is shorter than the novel. Comparatively, shorter medium lacks the intensity of emotions as depicted in Saba Imtiaz's



novel. The novelist has enough time and words to dig deep into the mind of Ayesha Khan, Saad, Zara, Sameer and other characters. Seriousness prevails and the novel's characters who are faced with unwelcoming atmosphere of Karachi where rule of law is out of existence. The filmmaker adapts this seriousness to provide some comic relief in the first half of the movie. Noor Chaudhry's gestures, her laziness and awkward behavior overshadow her mental agony. Later on, the superiority of visual art prevails over the verbal art. Noor Chaudhry and Malti win the audience's hearts through their acting. Their agony wins attention and grips the audience.

As the present novel and the movie are two different genres of art, both use various tactics to portray the best depiction of the characters and situations to win fame, popularity and response in terms of audience and finance. The movie adapts her character and does not present Noor Chaudhry a serious candidate for journalism. Therefore, her frustrations lie buried under her comic gestures and actions. Hence, the earlier part of the movie fails to portray Noor Chaudhry as an exact replica of Ayesha Khan. However, the later part of the movie is better than that of the earlier one. After Noor Chaudhry faces setback, audience are able to understand her real personality. She turns into a responsible and mature journalist, making rational decisions. Her empathy for her housemaid, her family and other such people are adapted signs by which one realized the inner goodness and capability of Noor Chaudhry.

The film *Noor* is not an exact replica of Saba Imtiaz's novel, *Karachi You're Killing Me*. Though the current movie takes an essence from the Saba Imtiaz's novel, yet under the impact of cinematic adaptation, the current movie moulds characters, their names, places, situations and circumstances that surround the protagonist. As far the protagonists of both works under discussion are concerned, both Ayesha and Noor Chaudhry are journalists faced with some personal and professional problems. Both are inflicted with the same issues such as boredom, laziness, mistreatment and emotional bereavement. In all, Noor is not an exact copy of Ayesha Khan. Ayesha Khan is maturer than Noor Chaudhry. Besides, Noor's problems are not as serious as those of Ayesha Khan.

The protagonist in the given movie does not represent herself as replica of the novel's Ayesha Khan. It is because both protagonists i.e. Ayesha Khan and Noor Chaudhry are much unlike each other. Bollywood's *Noor* looks to be a comedy in its first appearance; whereas the novel presents Ayesha to be a story of a serious looking girl who has some aspirations in her life. Noor Chaudhry is quite conscious of her weight; whereas Ayesha is conscious of her weight to a varying degree. Noor Chaudhry is quite funny when she is going to bathe in cold water at her house. The way she talks, walks and reacts to her boss' response is quite worth-smiling. Even her gaze arouses feelings of smile to the audience because most of the times, it is ironical. On the contrary, Ayesha Khan's issues multiply till the novel ends.

The movie does not mention Zardari killing black goat every day to ward off suffering because it is adapted in Indian characters, scenery and so on. Ayesha of the novel joins a gym where she takes certain exercises, preoccupied with the thought of her Islamiyat teacher at her college. On the contrary, Noor does not ever recall her any teacher from any quarter of her



educational career. Besides, Zara's report about hospital scam in which children are vaccinated water instead of polio vaccine is adapted to replace it with kidney scam in the movie. Two stories have been compressed into one story. House parties are rule of the day in the novel; whereas the same takes few and far between in the novel.

Songs, an integral part of any movie, are additional spice to the movie to attract the viewers. At the same times, these songs have been filmed in clubs which depict the high class culture of dance parties along with drinks. 'Karachi's New Year does not give the same look. Party at Faryal's house where Saad, Zara, Ayesha and other meet is not a part of the movie. The novel gives complete background of Saad and Ayesha relationship; whereas the movie gives only small portion of their early school days. According to the novel, Ayesha's friendship with Saad initiated since both meet in the sixth grade at school and join college together. Ayesha Khan narrates, 'We went to college together after which I enrolled in business school and Saad flew off to Cambridge.' She further adds, 'We Skyped every weekend for the four years he was away and had seen each other through death (his father, my mothe)'. All these details miss the attention of the filmmaker who adapts it and relies on minor details

According to Ayesha Khan, it is easier to find an assassin than a suitor in Karachi of 20 million people. Ayesha's father has been narrated as working in some office; whereas the film shows Noor Chaudhry's father sitting in his house throughout the movie. Ayesha's phone buzzes whereas Noor Chaudhry's mobile gives ringtone of dog barking, creating comic element in the movie. Rail tracks are blasted and damaged in Larkana, Hyderabad, Bin Qasim, Benazirabad, Jamshoro and Odero Lal. House no. 34, C Street Restaurant, Hassan, Zara's party, her love for Imran Khan and PTI and her younger brother, Imad, are out of existence in the film. Aforementioned details have been sacrificed for cinematic adaptation.

As per adaptation, the following characters and incidents of the novel have not been included in the movie. The selected movie does not make it an exact replica of the novel. Ayesha's party with Hassan, Zara and others is also not a part of the movie. Hassan's attitude, his intimacy-cum-subsiding relationship and Hassan's birthday party are also missing in the movie. Murder of a top member from a political party, and consequent gang-war are also neglected in the given movie. Ayesha's father loves watching Najam Sethi's TV show to know whether N league quits government or not; whereas such a thing cannot be expected from *Noor*, filmed on Indian soil. Pakistani politics based issues of the novel are sacrificed to be replaced by fictional issues.

In the novel, Kamran does not pay salaries and faces complaining remarks from Ayesha as well as other employees. It forces Ayesha Khan to resign; whereas Shekhar is a coward and compromising but salary related issues have been transformed in the movie. 'There has been a rape in Defence. Write on it, just go to the police station and see if you have a look at the FIR.' Ayesha visits the police station and meets cops who claim the victim to be a prostitute. Defence related incident about a girl's rape has been excluded in the movie to adapt it according to demands of Bollywood. Lack of aforementioned incidents in the movie does not make this movie an exact replica of the Saba Imtiaz's present novel. Pakistan literature festival is celebrated in Karachi



where Ayesha meets some people who become part of her memory. A foreign journalist for CNN and Twitter in Islamabad, James Maxwell, is adaptation of Bannerji. There is complete detail about his work portfolio in various countries around the world. Discussion about Afghanistan, Taliban and Usama Bin Laden are also nonexistent in the movie. Photographer and Ayesha Khan experience gun shots of two gangs in which she barely escapes death.

Saba Imtiaz's novel *Karachi You're Killing Me* is a biography of locals of Karachi under PPP government. It revolves around social, economic, political, literary and cultural activities of locals in Karachi during PPP era when Yousuf Raza Gillani and Asif Ali Zardari were prime minister and president respectively. According to the novel, headline of the day says: 'India falls in love with Hina Rabbani Khar.' Hina was foreign minister during PPP era. The novel throws light on Jesh-e-Muhammad's activities in Bahawalpur. Sania, the chief political correspondent, gets promotion after she obtains an interview of President Asif Ali Zardari. There is talk about General Zaheer of Pakistan army. A press conference of TPI leader, a pamphleteering Sipah-e-Sahaba protest and fear of blasphemy show presence of anti-Shia elements in religious communities in Karachi, Pakistan. A Spokesman says, 'Pakistan has become a garbage dump. Everyone can throw their trash here.' Ayesha's visit to Larkana to report election campaign, the description of road to Larkana, its traffic, its hotel, its staff and Nodero mausoleum etc. are only possible features of Karachi related novel. On the other hand, the under analysis movie sacrifices these incidents for cinematic adaptation and instead of real life incidents, it relies upon fictional names and characters.

Colonial building of a conference party, Jamaa-tu-Daawa, PPP, protestors for reinstatement of their jobs, Shia-Sunni conflict, The Daily News, Zainab Market Karachi, Karachi politics, discussion about Syrian conditions, Rahat Fateh Ali Khan's concert, a gym trainer in Karachi, anti-aging cream advertising bags in Karachi Fashion Week Show, MQM, power cuts and CNG crises in PPP era are specialty of *Karachi You're Killing Me*. Two boys mug in Zara's house; Ayesha interviews Hafiz Saeed, and Ayesha interviews Zafar who killed 100 people in gang war. These are additional information which fails to find any place in the Indian movie, *Noor*. Saad's plans to return back to Pakistan and consequent discussion with his family have also been missed by the filmmakers.

Apart from dissimilarities, there is much to resemble in both novel and the movie under this research.. Both works under present research are based on journalistic issues faced by Ayesha Khan and Noor Chaudhry. Both are faced with hurdles, blocking their path to work the way they like and aspire. The bosses in both works are limited in vision, forcing their workers not to take any adventurous move in their profession. The narrator says, 'kamran narrows his eyes and size everywhere.' Same is the case with Shekhar of Bollywood movie.

Laziness, frustration, smoking, drinks parties, text messages, emails, experience of extra-marital relations and cheating are the shared scenes and incidents in both these works. Ayesha says, 'I walk up to the police van on the site and hide behind it to light a cigarette.' Loneliness has inculcated haughtiness in both protagonists, arousing sensuousness in them. Consequently, both



Ayesha Khan and Noor experience sexual relations with their fellow journalists. Both get cheated by their lovers, but make a comeback to reinstate their morale afterwards. Both works end at the defeat of the villains such as Bannerji, Dr, Shinday and James Maxwell. In the end, love wins, uniting the protagonists with their friends in soon-to-be matrimonial relationships.

Text messages, emails and cold relations between protagonists and similar media owners are indications of resemblance between the novel and the movie. Shekhar is adaptation of Kamran from many perspectives. Kamran says, 'Kamran shrugs. This is a cooperation. I'm running a business here. This is not a place where you live out the fantasy of doing some expose that the world will love. I have to put my interest first.' James Maxwell shares bed with Ayesha in the same way as Bannerji does with Noor in a hotel. Both men lovers thief important stories of those girl journalists with whom they share beds at hotels. Both of them publish it by their own names at the platform of CNN.

8. CONCLUSION

It is concluded that Sunhil Sippy's Bollywood movie *Noor* is a cinematic adaptation of Saba Imtiaz's novel titled as *Karachi You're Killing Me*. The given Bollywood movie takes story from the above mentioned novel and shapes it according to the requirements of cinematic art i.e. film. The movie's protagonist, its theme and subsequent situations are replica of the novel. As both works hail from different and distinct genres, the cinematic representation brings about adaptation. The novel *Karachi You're Killing Me* is set in Pakistani background, depicting local culture during PPP era in Karachi. The characters, situations, scenes, discussions and places depict Karachi, highlighting social, political, economic, cultural and literary aspects of Pakistani society. Ayesha Khan, Zara, Sana, Saad, Hassan and kamran are Pakistanis in flesh and blood. On the other hand, as a Bollywood movie, *Noor* adapts the said novel's story and highlights journalism related issues faced by Indian characters in Indian atmosphere. Though the characters, settings, places, incidents and situations are Indians in every aspect of their presence, yet these are all adapted version of the present novel.

The movie adapts the story of a Pakistani journalist, Ayesha Khan, facing professional as well as personal issues in Karachi. The novel revolves around real life places and names such as Karachi, Larkana, Nodero, Nawab Shah and Islamabad where MQM, PPP, Sip-e-Sahaba, PTI, Jesh-e-Muhammad, Zainab Market, Krachi Festival, Asif Ali Zardari and Pakistani establishment are hot topics. The entire novel sums up PPP era which is followed by general elections of 2008. The current movie is set in Bombay, but it adapts Novel's characters into fictional names and places, escaping Indian or Pakistani politics. Except difference in names and places, everything remains the same. Ayesha Khan works in News 365 whereas Noor, in news channel. Characters' name and numbers are not quite the same in both works. Ayesha Khan's interview of an Al-Qaida detainee is adapted to Noor Chaudhry's documentary about kidney scam in the given movie.

Apart from that, novel and movie are quite different genres with pros and cons from the perspective of psychoanalysis. Saba Imtiaz has enough time and words to depict the external and internal world of Ayesha Khan. Hence, the novel highlights each aspect of the characters' life



through multiplicity of words. On the other hand, *Noor* is time bound work which lacks space enough to go extensively. Anyhow, visual art grips the audience when *Noor*'s story is stolen causing Vilas' murder. Most of the things are common in both works, yet the movie is an adapted work of the novel. Both protagonists have similar family conditions, similar professional issues and similarity in emotional attachment to those who deceive them. The movie and the novel end on optimistic note of union between two lovers. As a whole, it can be summed up that this movie is a replica of Saba Imtiaz's *Karachi You're Killing Me*. Hence, comparative analysis of both these works indicates that characters' names, places, events, situations and certain characters are unlike each other, yet *Noor* is a filmed version of *Karachi You're Killing Me*. The movie is an adaptation of the novel, and it has been moulded to suit the requirements of cinema related audience.

9. SIGNIFICANCE OF STUDY

The present study is significant because it clarifies the connections between literature and film. The idea investigates how literary work is converted into film and how this adaptation process impacts the narrative structure, the emphasis placed on particular topics, the depictions of the characters and situations to fulfill its objective. The cinematic adaptation as the theory's major contribution in the present study enables us to understand the distinctive characteristics of each medium. Understanding the contrast between literature and film might help the readers and audience better comprehend why certain adjustments are made when a literary piece is turned into a film. Both media have unique qualities and storytelling philosophies. For instance, a movie might employ visual tricks such as colours, lighting and background music to portray feelings or ambiance that the selected novel express through description.

The ability to assess the decisions made by directors during the adaptation process is another crucial part of cinematic adaptation theory. Understanding these impacts can help us better grasp the complexities of the adaptation process. These decisions may be influenced by elements including budget, audience expectations, and cultural context. In general, the cinematic adaptation theory is important because it enables us to comprehend the nuanced link between literature and film and how it may affect how tales are conveyed and perceived.

References:

- Al, K., & Siddique, A.R. (2020). Hedges in Pakistani English Novels: A Corpus-based Study. *Discourse Studies Forum*, 1(1), 60-71. Retrieved from <http://marspublishers.com/index.php/disfo/article/view/18>
- Azim, M.U., Hussain, Z., & Bhatti, A. M. (2019). Geoffrey Wright's *Macbeth*: A story of crime retold in the postmodern criminal world, *Al-Qalam*, 24(1), 750-760. Retrieved from <http://journal.alqalamjournalpu.com/index.php/Al-Qalam/article/view/780/492>
- Connor, J. D. (2007). The persistence of fidelity: Adaptation theory today. *M/C Journal*, 10(2).





- Hayward, S. (2022). *Cinema studies: The key concepts*. Taylor & Francis.
- Hutcheon, L. (2012). *A theory of adaptation*. Routledge.
- Imtiaz, Saba. (2014). *Karachi you are killing me*. Random House India.
- Qasim, K. (20220). "It's Karachi, its, Where Life and Love Come to Die": Representing Gender, Space and Identity in Karachi You Are killing Me. *Pakistan Journal of Gender Studies*, 22(2), 69-88. <https://doi.org/10.46568/pjgs.v22i2.627>
- Stam, R. (2004). *Literature through film: realism, magic, and the art of adaptation*. John Wiley & Sons.